

Cavanaugh Macdonald
CONSULTING, LLC
The experience and dedication you deserve

## Teachers' Retirement System of Montana Valuation as of July 1, 2009



Ed Macdonald, ASA, FCA, MAAA
Todd Green, ASA
Presented to SAVA Committee
October 29, 2009

## Table of Contents

> Actuary 101

- Cash Flow Characteristics and Need for Actuarial Valuations
- Selecting Assumptions about Future Events
- Fundamentals of Actuarial Valuations and Plan Sponsor Liabilities
> July 1, 2009 Valuation Results


## Actuary 101

# Cash Flow Characteristics and Need for Actuarial Valuations 

## Basic Retirement Funding Equation

$\mathbf{C}+\mathbf{I}=\mathbf{B}+\mathbf{E}$
C $=$ Contributions
I = Investment Income
B = Benefits Paid
$\mathrm{E}=$ Expenses (administration)

## Two Fundamentally Different Methods of Financing Retirement Benefits

Social Security: Pay-As-You-Go
Current generation pays benefits of prior generation.

Most Public Prefunded
Systems:
Current generation saves money for its own retirement; prior generation did the same.

## Pay-As-You-Go



## Pay-As-You-Go

Pay-As-You-Go Contributions
$\%$ of
Active Member Payroll


## Prefunding



## Prefunding



## Selecting Assumptions About Future Events

## Decremental

$>$ Withdrawal
$>$ Death while active
$>$ Disability
> Retirement
$>$ Death after retirement

## Economic

> Inflation
> Real return for assets
$>$ Salary increases
> COLA's

## Understanding Economic Assumptions

$$
\begin{array}{cl}
\quad \text { Interest Rate } & 7.75 \% \\
= & \underline{\text { Inflation Rate }} \\
=\text { Real Rate of Return } & \underline{3.50 \%} \\
\hline 4.25 \%
\end{array}
$$

Interest rate determines how much money we think we'll have.

Inflation rate tells us what we think it will buy.

# Fundamentals of Actuarial Valuations \& Plan Sponsor Liabilities 

## Census Data

| VALUATION DATE | July 1, 2009 |  |  | July 1, 2008 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Active members |  |  |  |  |
| Number |  |  |  |  |
| Full-Time Members |  | 12,673 |  | 12,694 |
| Part-Time Members |  | 5,783 |  | 5,598 |
| Annual compensation | \$ | 683,235 | \$ | 657,435 |
| Retired members and beneficiaries |  |  |  |  |
| Number |  | 12,036 |  | 11,788 |
| Annual allowances | \$ | 219,267 | \$ | 208,985 |
| Inactive Members |  |  |  |  |
| Vested Terminated Members |  | 1,640 |  | 1,649 |
| Non-Vested Terminated Members |  | 9,868 |  | 9,574 |

## Present Value

The present value of an amount of money payable in the future is the amount of money that, if we had it today, would accumulate to the amount that will be payable considering
> Investment Return
$>$ Probability that money will be paid

## Present Value of Future Benefits


B. Inactive Members and Annuitants

Service Retirement
Disability Retirement
Beneficiaries
Vested Terminated Members
Refund of Member Contributions
Total
C. Grand Total

| \$ | 2,256.4 | \$ | 2,161.3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 19.8 |  | 18.8 |
|  | 139.6 |  | 132.9 |
|  | 56.6 |  | 58.1 |
|  | 16.1 |  | 15.6 |
| \$ | 2,488.4 | \$ | 2,386.7 |
| \$ | 4,943.9 | \$ | 4,691.0 |

## Normal Cost

## Contribution For

Normal Cost

## Description

Value of this year's expected benefit accruals

## Normal Cost

| July 1, 2009 <br> Total |  | July 1, 2008 <br> Total |
| ---: | :--- | ---: |
|  |  |  |
| $8.74 \%$ |  | $8.85 \%$ |
| $0.11 \%$ |  | $0.11 \%$ |
| $0.29 \%$ |  | $0.26 \%$ |
| $0.44 \%$ |  | $0.45 \%$ |
| $1.11 \%$ |  | $1.20 \%$ |
|  |  | $10.87 \%$ |
| $10.69 \%$ |  |  |
| $7.15 \%$ |  | $7.15 \%$ |
| $3.54 \%$ |  | $3.72 \%$ |

## Market Value of Assets

|  | TOTAL <br> TRS 2009 |  | TOTAL <br> TRS 2008 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDITIONS |  |  |  |  |
| Contributions: |  |  |  |  |
| Employer | \$ | 66,850,644 | \$ | 67,930,235 |
| Plan Member |  | 57,256,365 |  | 59,560,549 |
| Other |  | 14,147,324 |  | 13,492,375 |
| Total Contributions | \$ | 138,254,333 | \$ | 140,983,159 |
| Misc Income | \$ | 15,421 | \$ | 15,654 |
| Investment Income: |  |  |  |  |
| Net Appreciation/(Depreciation) in Fair Value of Investments | \$ | $(671,716,604)$ | \$ | $(236,359,446)$ |
| Investment Earnings |  | 70,040,815 |  | 96,731,693 |
| Security Lending Income (Note A) |  | 4,318,004 |  | 9,544,163 |
| Investment Income/(Loss) | \$ | (597,357,785) | \$ | (130,083,590) |
| Less: Investment Expense |  | 13,562,768 |  | 15,425,847 |
| Less: Security Lending Expense (Note A) |  | 1,897,208 |  | 7,802,791 |
| Net Investment Income/(Loss) | \$ | $(612,817,761)$ | \$ | $(153,312,228)$ |
| Total Additions | \$ | $(474,548,007)$ | \$ | $(12,313,415)$ |
| DEDUCTIONS |  |  |  |  |
| Benefit Payments | \$ | 209,942,663 | \$ | 196,060,216 |
| Withdrawals |  | 5,170,028 |  | 5,694,601 |
| Administrative Expense (Note D) |  | 1,853,873 |  | 1,750,765 |
| OPEB Expenses |  | 49,496 |  | 47,478 |
| Total Deductions | \$ | 217,016,060 | \$ | 203,553,060 |
| NET INCREASE (DECREASE) |  |  |  |  |
| IN PLAN NET ASSETS | \$ | $(691,564,067)$ | \$ | $(215,866,475)$ |
| NET ASSETS HELD IN TRUST |  |  |  |  |
| FOR PENSION BENEFITS |  |  |  |  |
| BEGINNING OF YEAR |  | 2,993,392,632 |  | 3,209,259,107 |
| END OF YEAR |  | 2,301,828,565 |  | 2,993,392,632 |

## Actuarial Value of Assets

| Valuation Date July 1: |  | 2008 |  | 2009 |  | 2010 |  | 2011 |  | 2012 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A. Actuarial Value Beginning of Year |  | 3,006,232,625 | \$ | 3,159,134,766 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| B. Market Value End of Year |  | 2,993,392,632 |  | 2,301,828,565 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C. Market Value of Beginning of Year |  | 3,209,259,107 |  | 2,993,392,632 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Cash Flow |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D1. Contributions |  | 140,983,159 |  | 138,254,333 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D2. Benefit Payments |  | $(201,754,817)$ |  | $(215,112,691)$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D3. Net |  | $(60,771,658)$ | \$ | $(76,858,358)$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E. Investment Income |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E1. Market Total: B. - C. - D3. | \$ | $(155,094,817)$ | \$ | $(614,705,709)$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E2. Assumed Rate |  | 7.75\% |  | 7.75\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E3. Amount for Immediate Recognintion |  | 246,362,679 |  | 229,009,668 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E4. Amount for Phased-in Recognition |  | $(401,457,496)$ |  | $(843,715,377)$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F. Phased-In Recognition of Investment Income |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F1. Current Year: 0.25 * E4. | \$ | $(100,364,374)$ | \$ | $(210,928,844)$ | \$ | - | \$ | - | \$ | - |
| F2. First Prior Year |  | 67,675,494 |  | $(100,364,374)$ |  | $(210,928,844)$ |  | - |  | - |
| F3. Second Prior Year |  | - |  | 67,675,494 |  | $(100,364,374)$ |  | $(210,928,844)$ |  | - |
| F4. Third Prior Year |  | - |  | - - |  | 67,675,494 |  | $(100,364,374)$ |  | $(210,928,844)$ |
| F5. Total Recognized Investment Gain |  | $(32,688,880)$ | \$ | $(243,617,724)$ | \$ | (243,617,724) | \$ | $(311,293,218)$ | \$ | $(210,928,844)$ |
| G. Preliminary Actuarial Value End of Year A. + D3. + E3. + F5. | \$ | 3,159,134,766 | \$ | 3,067,668,352 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| H. Corridor |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| H1. 80\% of Market Value | \$ | 2,394,714,106 | \$ | 1,841,462,852 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| H2. 120\% of Market Value |  | 3,592,071,158 |  | 2,762,194,278 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| I. Actuarial Value End of Year <br> G. Not Less than H1. or Not Greater than H2 | \$ | 3,159,134,766 | \$ | 2,762,194,278 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J. Difference Between Market \& Actuarial Values |  | $(165,742,134)$ | \$ | $(460,365,713)$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## Historical Investment Returns

| Fiscal Year Ending | Market Returns | Actuarial Returns | Actuarial Return Over 8.00\% Assumption |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| June 30, 1995 | 15.7\% | 8.9\% | 0.9\% |
| June 30, 1996 | 12.4\% | 10.4\% | 2.4\% |
| June 30, 1997 | 19.4\% | 14.9\% | 6.9\% |
| June 30, 1998 | 16.6\% | 16.0\% | 8.0\% |
| June 30, 1999 | 11.9\% | 12.3\% | 4.3\% |
| June 30, 2000 | 7.8\% | 12.8\% | 4.8\% |
| June 30, 2001 | (5.1)\% | 9.2\% | 1.2\% |
| June 30, 2002 | (7.3)\% | 3.8\% | (4.2)\% |
| June 30, 2003 | 6.2\% | 1.6\% | (6.4)\% |
| June 30, 2004 | 13.3\% | 2.1\% | (5.9)\% |
| Fiscal Year Ending | Market Returns | Actuarial Returns | Actuarial Return Over 7.75\% Assumption |
| June 30, 2005 | 8.0\% | 2.7\% | (5.0)\% |
| June 30, 2006 | 8.9\% | 8.5\% | 0.7\% |
| June 30, 2007 | 17.6\% | 10.2\% | 2.5\% |
| June 30, 2008 | (4.9)\% | 7.2\% | (0.6)\% |
| June 30, 2009 | (20.8)\% | (10.3)\% | (18.0)\% |
| 15 Year Average | 6.0\% | 7.2\% | (0.8)\% |

## Historical Investment Returns



## Market Value Vs. Actuarial Value



# Unfunded Accrued Liability Contribution Rate 

## Contribution For

Unfunded Accrued Liability (UAL)

## Description

Accrued Liability -
Actuarially Valued Assets
"Unfunded Accrued Liabilities" are a natural part of retirement system funding, comparable to a mortgage on a home. A plan which is $100 \%$ funded is required to contribute the normal cost.

## Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability


A. Actuarial present value of all future benefits for present and former members and their survivors (Table 6)
B. Less actuarial present value of total future normal costs for present members
C. Actuarial accrued liability
D. Less present value of future university supplemental contributions
$E$. Less assets available for benefits
F. Unfunded actuarial accrued liability

July 1, 2009
July 1, 2008

|  | 612.9 | 580.2 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \$ | 4,331.0 | \$ | 4,110.8 |
|  | 157.2 | \$ | 157.1 |
|  | 2,762.2 |  | 3,159.1 |
| \$ | 1,411.6 | \$ | 794.6 |

## Actuarial (Gains)/Losses

| June 30, 2009 |  | June 30, 2008 |  | June 30, 2007 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \$ | 561.9 | \$ | 17.0 | \$ | (67.7) |
|  | (4.4) |  | 4.8 |  | 2.5 |
|  | 6.3 |  | (1.0) |  | (0.9) |
|  | 0.4 |  | 0.2 |  | 0.2 |
|  | (0.2) |  | 0.3 |  | (1.0) |
|  | 4.7 |  | 1.7 |  | 7.2 |
|  | (2.8) |  | (6.3) |  | 0.5 |
|  | 12.0 |  | 2.5 |  | (1.6) |
| \$ | 577.9 | \$ | 19.2 | \$ | (60.8) |
|  | - |  | (10.6) |  | - |
|  | - |  | - |  | - |
| \$ | 577.9 | \$ | 8.6 | \$ | (60.8) |

## Investment Income

Investment income was (greater) less than expected based on actuarial value of assets.

## Pay Increases

Pay increases were (less) greater than expected.
Age \& Service Retirements
Members retired at (older) younger ages or with (less) greater final average pay than expected

## Disability Retirements

Disability claims were (less) greater than expected
Death-in-Service Benefits
Survivor claims were (less) greater than expected
Withdrawal From Employment
(More) less reserves were released by withdrawals than expected

Death After Retirement
Retirees (died younger) lived longer than expected

## Other

Miscellaneous (gains) and losses
Total (Gain) or Loss During Period From Financial Experience

## Non-Recurring Items.

Changes in actuarial assumptions caused a (gain) loss. Changes in benefits caused a (gain) loss.

Composite (Gain) Loss During Period.

## Schedule of Funding Progress



## Annual Required Contribution (ARC)

| CONTRIBUTIONS FOR FISCAL YEARS |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ENDING | 2012 | 2010 and 2011 |
| Total Normal Rate | 10.69\% | 10.87\% |
| Employee Contribution Rate | 7.15\% | 7.15\% |
| Employer Normal Rate | 3.54\% | 3.72\% |
| Employer Statutory Contribution Rate |  |  |
| Normal Rate | 3.54\% | 3.72\% |
| UAL Rate | 6.42\% | 6.24\% |
| Total Rate | 9.96\% | 9.96\% |
| Amortization Period | Infinite | 31.3 |
| Required Increase in Statutory Contribution Rate | 4.11\% | 0.17\% |
| Employer ARC under GASB |  |  |
| Normal Rate | 3.54\% | 3.72\% |
| UAL Rate | 10.53\% | 6.41\% |
| Total Rate | 14.07\% | 10.13\% |
| Amortization Period | 30 | 30 |

## Cash Flow

Historical

| 600 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 400 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 200 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $200 \sim \square$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| -200 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| -400 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| -600 $\square$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| -800 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 2000 | 2001 | 2002 | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 |
| Contributions | 94.1 | 99.9 | 100.2 | 104.3 | 107.9 | 110.7 | 212.3 | 169.2 | 141.0 | 138.3 |
| Benflts \& Adm. Expenses | 115.8 | 126.0 | 138.1 | 148.6 | 158.5 | 167.1 | 178.4 | 190.4 | 203.6 | 217.0 |
| $\square$ Investment Income | 175.2 | -119.1 | -159.6 | 126.2 | 281.8 | 188.7 | 224.8 | 484.5 | -153.3 | -612.8 |
| -Net Cash Flow | 153.5 | -145.2 | -197.5 | 81.9 | 231.2 | 132.3 | 258.7 | 463.3 | -215.9 | -691.5 |

## Cash Flow Projection

Statutory Basis


## Cash Flow Projection

ARC Basis


## Estimated Projected Employer ARC

| Fiscal Year Ended |  | Employer ARC |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2010 | $10.13 \%$ |  |
| 2011 | $10.13 \%$ |  |
| 2012 | $14.07 \%$ |  |
| 2013 | $16.56 \%$ |  |
| 2014 | $18.95 \%$ |  |
| 2015 | $20.43 \%$ |  |

