

**Table 2: Medical Malpractice Insurers in Montana, by market share, premiums earned, losses, paid claims, settlements, if available, for FY 2006 & 2008**

Insurer (order by market share)	FY 2006							FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09										
	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims w/ direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases				
Utah Medical Ins. Assoc.		\$14,530,208	\$7,792,208	For Physicians			\$9,976,336	32.74%	\$14,055,590	\$3,191,653	For Physicians			\$6,443,860				
				85	30	45 (9)							104		7	4 (0)		
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio (a)			For Health Care Facilities						Pure Direct Loss Ratio				For Health Care Facilities			
		53.63%			3	1					--	22.71%			4	0	1(0)	
Mountain States Healthcare Reciprocal Risk Retention Group		\$8,894,136	\$4,322,985	For Physicians			\$432,148	17.86%	\$7,737,410	minus \$1,746,406 (b)	For Physicians			\$1,331,293				
				16									20					
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio			For Health Care Facilities						Pure Direct Loss Ratio				For Health Care Facilities			
		48.60%			32							-22.57%			40			
Doctors Co., An Interinsurance Exchange		\$8,241,757	\$6,552,203	For Physicians			\$3,720,000	16.92%	\$7,653,470	\$1,689,837	For Physicians			\$4,343,000				
				133	10	11 (9)							--		18	19(12)		
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio									Pure Direct Loss Ratio							
		79.50%										22.08%						
Yellowstone Insurance Exchange Risk Retention Group		\$3,494,653	\$1,388,203				\$362,244	9.37%	\$4,071,420	\$841,681				\$1,917,500				
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio			For Health Care Facilities						Pure Direct Loss Ratio				For Health Care Facilities			
		39.72%			7	data distorted					1	20.68%			8	0	1 (6) data distorted	

Insurer	FY 2006							FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09									
	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims w/ direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases			
Columbia Casualty Co.		\$1,215,496	\$329,018	For Physicians			\$962,765	4.18%	\$1,682,349	\$1,080,969	For Physicians			\$156,473			
				0	0	0									1	1	1(1)
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities							Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities				
		27.07%		10	3	3					64.27%		9		0	0	
Preferred Professional Ins. Co.		\$1,439,894	\$943,447	For Physicians			\$1,070,026	3.58%	\$1,523,323	\$1,957,914	For Physicians			\$534,152			
				--	5	1(0)											
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities							Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities				
		65.52%		--	--	0 listed (1 settled)					128.56%						
Medical Protective Co.		\$160,098	-\$254,000	For Physicians			0	2.05%	\$595,992	\$273,000	For Physicians			0			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-	-	0 listed (1 closed w/o settlement)					Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-		-	1 (verdict for insurer)	
		-1.59%		For Dentists							45.81%		For Dentists				
				10	-	1 (2 closed w/o settlement)					1	-	1				
Hudson Specialty Ins. Co.		\$1,033,185	\$254,229	For Physicians			\$9,916	1.89%	\$871,550	\$871,194	For Physicians			\$9,916			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		2	3	1					Pure Direct Loss Ratio						
		24.61%		For Health Care Facilities							99.86%		For Health Care Facilities				
				1	-	-											

Insurer	FY 2006							FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09						
	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims w/ direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases
Steadfast Ins Co.		\$482,399	\$358,201	For Physicians			\$175,000	1.76%	\$695,338	\$282,042	For Physicians			nothing listed
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-	-	-			Pure Direct Loss Ratio					
		74.25%		For Health Care Facilities					40.58%		For Health Care Facilities			
				-	-	-								
American Casualty Co of Reading PA		\$540,561	\$337,940	For Physicians			0	1.45%	\$637,687	\$369,404	For All Other Specialties***			\$371,500
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		0	0	0			Pure Direct Loss Ratio		15	2	5	
		62.52%		For Registered Nurses					57.84%		For Registered Nurses			
				7	1	0					12	2	2	
Lexington Ins Co.		\$668,582	-\$188,875	For all other specialties***			0	1.11%	\$740,854	-\$313,755 (a)	For All Other Specialties***			-\$11,765
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		1	0	0			Pure Direct Loss Ratio		1	0	0	
		-28.25%		For Health Care Facilities					-42.38%		For Health Care Facilities			
				1	0	0					3	0	1	
NCMIC Ins Co.		\$353,290	-\$20,996	For all other specialties***			\$50,000	0.92%	\$397,105	\$231,955	For all other specialties***			0
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		3	1	3			Pure Direct Loss Ratio		6	1	4(1)	
		-5.94							58.44%					

\* The incurred losses formula is: losses paid in current year + unpaid liability at the end of the current year minus unpaid liability at the end of the prior year.

\*\*The report indicates for Yellowstone Ins. Exchange Risk Retention Group that 305,000 claims were closed and that \$10 in losses were paid out.

\*\*\*The form lists physicians, osteopaths, podiatrists, dentists, optometrists, registered nurses, licensed practical nurse, health care facilities, and all other specialties.

(a) The Pure Direct Loss Ratio indicates the health of a company. A percentage above or close to 100% indicates solvency problems. However, the numbers here just reflect Montana data and a company with a good (or bad) loss ratio in this state may have businesses in other states that offset that ratio.

(b) The negative number most likely refers to a recalculation by an actuary that indicates the unpaid liability booked in the previous year was more than required to pay claims (leading to a negative incurred loss).

Source: State Auditor's Reports, Market Share - by Line of Business and Montana Medical Malpractice Professional Liability Experience Report, Fiscal Years 2006 and 2008.